

as found in
Duff, Charles

Statement of Facts.



A

STATEMENT OF FACTS

IN CONNECTION WITH THE SETTLEMENT

OF

REV. ROBT. J. CAMERON,

IN

St. Andrew's Church,

St. John, N. B.

ST. JOHN, N. B.:

J. & A. McMILLAN, PRINTERS, 78 PRINCE WM. STREET.

1871.

STATEMENT OF FACTS.

The election of the Reverend Mr. Cameron, as the successor to the late Rev. Dr. Donald, in the Pastoral charge of St. Andrew's Church, has occasioned so much dissatisfaction amongst a large portion of the congregation, that, in the interests of the Church, it seems proper to lay a statement of the facts before the Synod. We are not sufficiently informed, as regards the mode of procedure, to be able to say whether or not it is competent for the Synod now to take action in the matter; but we submit the facts for their consideration, and to be dealt with as they may see fit. Their publication, at all events, will afford those who feel an interest in the matter an opportunity of judging for themselves as between Mr. Cameron and those who opposed him.

For ourselves, we can only say, that we disclaim any hostile or unfriendly feeling towards Mr. Cameron personally; we have been influenced, in our opposition to him, only by an earnest desire for the welfare of a Church with which many of us have been connected since our childhood, and for which we all entertain a warm attachment.

If, to the Synod and to the minds of impartial men, his conduct shall appear to have been that of a faithful minister of Christ, free from reproach and blameless, zealous only to do His master's work and to "spend and be spent" in His service, far be it from us to assail or impugn his character, in any respect. But if, on the other hand, it should appear that he has forgotten his duty to his

Master in the pursuit of objects purely personal and temporal; and that to attain these he has turned aside into "crooked ways" and has been guilty of conduct, unbecoming a Christian minister and unworthy of his sacred calling, then it is our duty, alike to the Church and to ourselves, to let the facts be known to the Synod. And we submit this statement of the facts to them for their judgment.

In order to understand the position in which the matter stands it will be necessary to refer to the correspondence out of which Mr. Cameron's first connection with St. Andrew's Church arose. It commenced by the following letter of the Rev. Dr. Donald to him :

ST. JOHN, NEW BRUNSWICK, 9th Aug., 1869.

DEAR SIR,—Talking of you and your prospects with your friend, Rev. F. R. McDonald, now minister elect to St. James' Church, Newcastle, Miramichi, I was led to inquire whether you would be inclined or induced to return to America, or would accept a mission charge, or assistantship, or anything of that nature. As Mr. McDonald could not satisfy me on these points, I am induced now to inquire personally. But as one ought to be guided pretty much by what prospects are held out to him, I shall state what are our wants, and what the prospects are to a young man. First, I would mention a mission station, nine miles from the city. I cherished this as a preaching station for many years, and at last got a church built, and for the last three or four years Mr. Caie has acted as missionary, as well as in Portland; but his new church being now completed, and requiring two services each Sabbath, he can but with great difficulty attend to Rothesay. Hence the necessity for a missionary for that station. I may mention that for several years I gave afternoon service there in summer, besides preaching twice in my own church in town. I therefore feel a particular interest in Rothesay, and am anxious for a missionary likely to keep the people together and gather more. In addition to this, and in conjunction with it, I have in view an assistant for myself. The two in conjunction should yield a salary of at least £200 currency. Another mission within the limits of our Presbytery, but a pretty difficult and somewhat scattered one, would yield a stipend of at least £250 currency if properly worked up. Such is a brief outline of the present wants and prospects of our Church in this Presbytery; and what I desire to know is, whether, for the good of the Church and the glory of its Head, you would be inclined

to cast in your lot with us here. Be kind enough to inform me as to this by return of mail if possible, and oblige,

My dear sir, yours very truly,

W. DONALD, D. D.,
Presbytery Clerk.

Though I sign as Presbytery Clerk, let me explain that I have not consulted, nor had time to consult the Presbytery on this matter.

To this letter Mr. Cameron replied as follows :

GLASGOW, Aug. 28th, 1869.

"Some time ago I saw Prof. Jardine in this country, and he was urging on me to go out to Fredericktown. I did not see my way clearly to go out merely as assistant to Dr. Brooke. By last mail, according to promise, I wrote him, stating that I would give the subject a favorable consideration if I were offered the succession to Dr. Brooke, with a salary of £250 currency.

"I do not, at present, see my way to go to St. John on other terms. I might go out as your assistant, and labour with you as such for a year, provided at the end of that time, *on my giving satisfaction to you and the congregation*, steps should be taken to appoint me successor. This is the most I can do.

"R. J. CAMERON."

On the receipt of this letter from Mr. Cameron Dr. Donald laid it before the Trustees and Elders ; and a Committee was appointed to prepare Resolutions thereon to be submitted to a Meeting of the Congregation. Resolutions were accordingly prepared which were afterwards submitted to a meeting of the Congregation, in October, and passed ; and they are as follow :

I. Resolved, That it is desirable to procure the services of a minister as an assistant to Dr. Donald, in St. Andrew's Church, St. John, in connection with a Mission to Rothesay.

II. *A letter from Rev. R. J. Cameron, dated Glasgow, Aug. 28th, 1869*, having been read, and it being considered desirable to secure the services of Mr. Cameron in accordance with the foregoing Resolution, and it being understood that the sum of \$200 will be contributed by the congregation at Rothesay, and \$100 by Dr. Donald towards the payment of salary of \$1000 asked by Mr. Cameron, Therefore Resolved, That this congregation pledge itself to raise the sum of \$700 as its portion of salary for one year to Mr. Cameron, and that a Committee be appointed to do so, with

the instructions that it take immediate steps towards this object, notifying Dr. Donald when the amount is raised or guaranteed; the funds as they are realized to be handed over to the Trustees of this Church for the object herein contemplated.

III. Resolved, That Dr. Donald be, and he is hereby instructed, as soon as he is notified as above, to communicate with Mr Cameron *accepting his proposal on the basis of the foregoing Resolutions.*

IV. Resolved, That a Committee be appointed to inquire whether additional legislation is necessary to legalize the appointment of a Colleague and successor to Dr. Donald, and if found necessary, to take steps to secure it, either by an Act granting same privileges to all the congregations in the Province in this connexion (in which case they are to put themselves in communication with said congregations, with a view to procuring their co-operation in the passage of such Act,) or otherwise.

Meeting Adjourned.

(Signed)

WM. DONALD,
Chairman.

(Signed) W. C. WATSON, Secretary.

In accordance with these Resolutions Dr. Donald again wrote to Mr. Cameron as follows :

St. John, New Brunswick, }
2nd November, 1869. }

DEAR SIR—Unavoidable circumstances have occurred to prevent my writing sooner. I am happy to be able to say now that I am authorized to comply with the terms stated by you, *in so far as to guarantee you, for one year from the date of your entering on your duties, one thousand dollars as missionary at Rothesay and assistant to me.* Whether a longer engagement may be entered into with you will depend very much upon yourself. whether you give satisfaction to me and the congregation.

There is every probability, that, should you please me and the people, a more permanent engagement will be formed with you at the end of the year, BUT AS TO THAT NEITHER I NOR THE CONGREGATION WILL AT PRESENT AGREE TO GIVE ANY PLEDGE *till you are in the field and have given proof of your ministerial qualifications and abilities for some time.* Meantime I may assure you of a candid hearing and a fair trial.

I may mention that you will have to preach once each Sabbath at Rothesay, and in my Church here, and give your assistance at a week-day evening meeting once a week here, with such other assistance as circumstances may require, and as may be agreeable.

If you accept these terms it is very desirable that you should be here as soon as you conveniently can.

Please let me have an answer by return of mail and oblige,

Dear Sir,

Yours truly,

W. DONALD.

Rev. Robert James Cameron,
14 Grafton street, Glasgow. }

This correspondence contains the only agreement made with Mr. Cameron, and he accepted an engagement on the terms of Dr. Donald's letter of 2nd Nov., 1869. He arrived in St. John in February following, and at once entered upon the discharge of his duties as a Missionary and Assistant to Dr. Donald, at a salary of \$1000 per annum. Before the year of his engagement had terminated however, Dr. Donald's health became very precarious, and his resignation was daily expected. In view of the probable vacancy in St. Andrew's Church, Mr. Cameron, as early as the month of December, 1870, began to press his claims upon different members of the congregation, to be appointed to its pastoral charge. He asserted that he had been promised the successorship if his services were satisfactory to the congregation and Dr. Donald, and if he did not obtain it he had been misled and deceived. Upon the minds of some of the congregation his assertion to that effect, although unsupported by any evidence of its truth, undoubtedly had great weight, and influenced their subsequent course of action. They committed themselves to his support, and they did support him in consequence.

At length, Dr. Donald resigned; and the Church was formally preached vacant on Sunday, 26th January, 1871.

On the 2nd February following a meeting of the Elders and Trustees was held to consider matters relating to the vacancy. At this meeting a communication was read from the Presbytery intimating that Dr. Donald had been released from his charge; and an application was also read from Mr. Cameron requesting to be nominated for the vacant pastorate. Mr. Girvan, one of the Elders, thereupon submitted a Resolution to the effect that a call should be given to Mr. Cameron at once; that notice of it should

be given from the pulpit on Sunday the 5th of February, and that the election should take place on the following Thursday and Friday, the 9th and 10th days of February. This was opposed by a portion of the Trustees and Elders. They urged that this was the principal Church, in connection with the Church of Scotland, in the Lower Provinces; that the appointment, when made, would be for life; and that, in every point of view—as well for the Congregation as for the Church of Scotland itself—it was important that the best available talent should be procured to fill it. They did not object to Mr. Cameron as one candidate; they were willing to give him a fair trial; but they wished him to be put in competition with others. And the precipitate action proposed by Mr. Girvan's resolution, they contended, would exclude competitors, and would virtually close the Church against other candidates. Mr. Cameron's friends replied that the Church was not open to competition. They alleged that he had come to this country on a *distinct and positive promise* made to him, through Dr. Donald, and by Resolution of the Congregation, that, at the expiration of a year, if his services were satisfactory to Dr. Donald and the Congregation, the necessary steps would be taken to appoint him to the pastoral charge of the Church. They asserted that to place him in competition with others for the vacancy now would be a gross breach of faith on the part of the Congregation, and a violation of the promise made to him by Dr. Donald. On the other hand, it was denied that any such Resolution of the Congregation had ever been passed, or that Dr. Donald had ever made any such promise; and it was contended, that if he had ever made such a promise, it was wholly unauthorised. And Mr. Cameron's friends were called upon to produce Dr. Donald's letter, and the Minutes of the Congregational Meeting to which they referred; but no Minutes of the Meeting in question could be found, and it was said that the Resolutions passed at it had been mislaid or lost. The only copy of Dr. Donald's letter then known to be in existence, it was said, *was in Mr. Cameron's possession and could not be obtained*. After a good deal of discussion the Meeting finally adjourned until Saturday, 4th February, without having passed any Resolution on the subject.

In the forenoon of the 4th of February, Mr. Watson, (an Elder and one of Mr. Cameron's warmest supporters) having previously understood from him that the letter of Dr. Donald contained a promise of the kind alleged, called upon him with the view of obtaining it to lay before the adjourned meeting of the Elders and Trustees that afternoon. He had an interview with Mr. Cameron, and stated the purpose for which he had called. He informed him that the fact of any such promise having been made to him was disputed; and he expressed his conviction that if the letter containing it were produced at the Meeting it would put an end to all opposition. Mr. Cameron declined to furnish him with the letter for that purpose, saying that it was equivocal, and that Mr. Robertson (the Chairman of the Elders and Trustees) had advised him not to produce it, and had even spoken in severe terms of Dr. Donald for having written it. He, however, read to Mr. Watson the following extracts from it, and no more: "There is every probability that should you please me and the people, a more permanent engagement will be made with you at the end of the year; * * * * * meantime I may assure you of a candid hearing, and a fair trial." We beg attention now to the letter which will be found at page 5, and the passage between these extracts, which Mr. Cameron did not read.

At the Meeting on Saturday, 4th February, Mr. Murdoch, one of the Trustees, submitted the following amendment to Mr. Girvan's Resolution:

"Whereas the resignation of our late Pastor, the Rev. Dr. Donald, having been accepted by the Presbytery of St. John (in connection with the Church of Scotland) and the Pastorate of the Church declared vacant, it becomes the duty of the Elders and Trustees of St. Andrew's Church by virtue of the power vested in them by 2nd Wm. IV., Chap. 18, Sec. 6, to nominate a candidate or candidates for the pastoral charge of said Church, if said candidate or candidates shall be in British America; And Whereas this duty is one of grave responsibility, the proper or improper discharge of which may affect not only the present harmony of the Church, but its future peace and prosperity for many years to come, and through it, the interests of Presbyterianism, in New Brunswick: And Whereas in a matter of so much importance as the choice and settlement of a Minister, it is

not only desirable but expedient, that time and opportunity should be allowed for giving due publicity to the fact of the ministerial vacancy which now exists ; and also that a reasonable time should be given for correspondence with parties who may be qualified and willing to be put in nomination for the pastoral charge of said Saint Andrew's Church. Therefore, be it

“ Resolved, That immediate steps be taken to give due publicity of the present pastoral vacancy, by having circulars forwarded to the Clerks and Moderators of Synods in connection with the Church of Scotland in the Upper and Lower Provinces, and also by notification, for one month at least, in the principal Presbyterian periodicals published in the Dominion. And it is further

“ Resolved, That applications for Candidature be received until the _____ day of _____.”

This amendment led to a long and acrimonious discussion, in the course of which Mr. Forbes, the Secretary to the Trustees, charged upon its supporters that it was “dishonorable” and “dishonest” to put Mr. Cameron in competition with other candidates, after the pledge which had been given to him, and upon the faith of which he had come to this country. It was in vain that those in favor of the amendment asked for some evidence that such a pledge had been given. The Resolutions of the congregational meeting were not to be found, and Dr. Donald's letter was not forthcoming. After some time, the amendment was about to be put ; and, with every prospect of its being carried, when the chairman, Mr. Robertson, took exception to the phraseology of some portions of it, expressing his fears that it conveyed a meaning beyond what was apparent. His fears, if he had any, were without the least foundation ; the amendment speaks for itself, and it is perfectly plain and intelligible. But the mover of it being desirous to conciliate all parties, if possible, and having no objects in view but the welfare of the Church, and to secure the services of the most efficient Pastor, said that they might put it in any language they pleased, provided it secured time and publicity. Mr. Cameron having been put in nomination, the chairman and Mr. Forbes, (assisted by Mr. Murdoch), settled an amendment in a form which seemed to be satisfactory to them ; or which, at all events, silenced their

opposition. It was in substance : that the election should take place on the first Thursday and Friday in April ; and that notice of the pastoral vacancy should be given, by circulars, to the different Presbyteries and Synods of the Dominion, and by publication in the principal Presbyterian periodicals in the Dominion.

The Amendment in that form, was put to the Meeting and carried, with but one dissentient voice, that of Mr. Watson ; who, misled by the extracts from Dr. Donald's letter which had been read to him that morning by Mr. Cameron, and believing that Mr. Cameron was entitled to a " permanent engagement " at once, voted against it.

It was urged, at this Meeting, that inasmuch as Mr. Cameron claimed that the Congregation should proceed to an election at once, and insisted upon his right to be placed before them without competition, honourable men would be unwilling to offer themselves as candidates whilst he occupied the pulpit. And it was suggested that he should retire and cease to officiate in the Church for a time, so that it might be, in *fact* as well as in *form*, vacant. This reasonable proposition, his friends at the meeting, and Mr. Cameron himself, afterwards, indignantly refused to accede to. One of the Elders, conceiving that it might be unpleasant for Mr. Cameron to remain in the City and not officiate in the pulpit which he had been accustomed to fill, suggested that in the meantime he might make a visit to his friends. It was believed that the visit would afford him an agreeable relaxation, and would relieve him from any embarrassment which he might feel from vacating the pulpit if he remained here. This, and this only, was the motive which prompted the suggestion. Some of Mr. Cameron's friends informed him of what transpired at this meeting, and it annoyed him exceedingly. He was very indignant at the proposal that he should temporarily vacate the pulpit. In a conversation with Mr. Murdoch in the forenoon of the 9th Feb., he exhibited considerable excitement ; and he asked how any one dared to suggest that he should absent himself from this city. Mr. Murdoch regretted the unhappy differences which had arisen, assured him that no one in the congregation wished to do him any wrong ; told him that the Resolutions of the Congregational

Meeting could not be found, but if he produced Dr. Donald's letter and it contained such a pledge as he alleged, he had no doubt that pledge would be faithfully and honourably redeemed by the Congregation. He replied that *Dr. Donald's letter contained private matter and could not be shown*. After this statement any further allusion to it was, of course, out of the question.

We were not aware of it at the time, but it was the fact, as we subsequently discovered, that whilst so much difference of opinion existed and such angry discussion was going on amongst the Elders and Trustees, as to the nature of the missing Resolutions of the Congregational Meeting, Mr. Cameron had them, or copies of them, in his possession, and could have put an end to all disputes at once by producing them. He afterwards admitted to Mr. Watson that he had received them in a private letter from Mr. Forbes; and, in reply to a remark of Mr. Watson's, that perhaps he was relying upon some statement contained in Mr. Forbes' letter, he said that the latter ought not to be blamed, for it was not upon his statements but upon those contained in Dr. Donald's letter that he relied.

On the afternoon of the 9th Feb., another meeting of the Elders and Trustees was held, at which Mr. Murdoch was not present; and Mr. Forbes, as Secretary, having in the usual way read over the Minutes of the former meeting, they were confirmed without remark. But in the Minutes thus confirmed the Amendment to Mr. Girvan's Resolution does not appear in the shape in which it was passed at the meeting of the 4th February. As it appears in the confirmed Minutes, *no provision is made for notification of the vacancy by Circulars to the Presbyteries and Synods or by publication in the Presbyterian periodicals*. In short, those points in it which Mr. Murdoch had especially designed to secure, and which its original supporters deemed of the most vital importance, had been eliminated. Mr. Forbes says, indeed, and so does the Chairman, that they never were in it. If they were not, then a large portion of the Elders and Trustees could not have known what they were talking about, and they must have wasted a great deal of discussion about nothing. But they were in it when it was passed, as can be proved by the affidavits of a number of the

Elders and Trustees present; and even by that of Mr. Watson who voted against it, and whose opposition to it was, in some degree at least, on account of their being in it.

We did not discover that this omission had been made in the Minutes of the amended Resolution until some considerable time after the 9th of February. We found that no notice of the vacancy was given either by publication or by circulars; and, as a matter of course, no other candidate offered himself. When we became aware of this we remonstrated, and we complained that we were not fairly treated. We were told that if we had any other candidates for the vacancy we could produce them before the day of election. To use the mildest language, this was only trifling, not only with us, but what is of much more importance, with the best interests of St. Andrew's Church. They well knew that no honorable clergyman of the Church of Scotland would thrust himself forward into a pulpit so tenaciously clung to by the occupant; or would allow himself to be brought forward as a candidate at the instance of any individual Elder or Trustee, or by any body of men other than those legally authorised to put him in nomination, namely, the Elders and Trustees in their collective and corporate capacity.

On Sunday, 26th March, an intimation was given to the congregation from the pulpit, that a call or nomination had been given to the Rev. Robert J. Cameron, and that an election for his choice or rejection would be held in the Church on Thursday and Friday, 6th and 7th of April, and this notice was repeated on the following Sunday by the Rev. Mr. Burgess in the morning and the Rev. Mr. McKay in the evening. This intimation was given at the request of the Chairman and Secretary alone, and without any order from the Elders and Trustees, *who had never been called together after the 9th of February.*

In the meantime, however, a Petition was prepared, addressed to the Elders and Trustees, and signed by forty-six "Pew owners, communicants and regular sitters" in St. Andrew's Church. The Petition sets forth amongst other things, that

"We believe it has been the custom in our Church, in the Colonies, that when it became necessary for a Congregation to

select a Minister, the privilege of having several candidates for the charge was afforded them, in order that they might have the opportunity of choosing the one who might prove the most acceptable to the Congregation. We feel therefore that the arrangements which have been made by you practically exclude us from hearing any Minister who might feel disposed to offer himself as a candidate.

"We must also express our surprise that, although the Church was declared vacant on the 22nd day of January last, no public intimation has been given of the fact, nor to our knowledge has any Minister but one, been nominated by you to the candidature of said vacant charge.

"We appeal therefore to you, as the guardians of our rights in this important question, and ask that you will not force us into the position of having to vote for or against the only party you have nominated, without giving us the opportunity of hearing other Ministers, and thereby enabling us the better to make a selection.

"In our movement in this matter, we desire to assure you that we are solely actuated by a sincere wish to preserve the harmony of the Congregation and to prevent its possible disruption should the election be forced upon us at the very early day you have named.

"We therefore trust that you will carefully consider the very important interests involved, and we most earnestly request that you will defer the election of a Minister to supply the place of our late esteemed Pastor, for such a period as the law governing these matters permits.

"In the interim, we hope you will cause the vacancy to be known in the Synods of our Church in Scotland as well as in the Dominion, as we believe the income which Saint Andrew's Church can offer is such as will secure a Clergyman of the highest talent. Your Petitioners therefore earnestly request that the Rev. Mr. Cameron have liberty to retire from the temporary charge of the Congregation, in order that the way may be perfectly open to receive and hear other candidates."

A meeting of the Elders and Trustees was held on the 28th March to consider this Petition. Mr. Murdoch requested the minutes of the meeting of 4th February to be read. He called attention to the important omission which had been made in the Resolution then passed with regard to notifying the vacancy in the Church; and he stated that had he been present on 9th February, the minutes in that shape would not have been con-

firmed, at least without opposition. No alteration in the minutes, as confirmed, was made, and the Petition was ordered to be filed, no attention whatever being paid to its prayer.

Some time in February, the Resolutions passed at the congregational meeting in 1869 had been found, and, afterwards, shortly before this meeting, a draft of the letter of 2nd November, 1869, from Dr. Donald (now deceased), had been discovered amongst his papers. And it was moved at this meeting, by Mr. Lindsay, that the Letter and Resolutions should be published, and that two copies of them should be left in each pew in the Church, so that the congregation, before the approaching election, might see what promises had been made to Mr. Cameron. To avoid this the adjournment was moved by his friends, and the chairman immediately left the chair, declaring the meeting adjourned.

It was manifest, however, that concealment was now no longer possible. We intimated our intention of publishing them, if Mr. Cameron did not; and, apparently in anticipation of our doing so, he took them late one evening, to the office of one of the newspapers in the city, and had them printed the following morning, together with *the portion of his own letter to Dr. Donald* of 28th August, 1869, which we have given at page 5. Some of his friends now abandoned him; one of them, Mr. Watson, especially, in consequence of the deception which he felt had been practised upon him by Mr. Cameron in reading the extracts from the letter on 4th February. Many, however, notwithstanding the discovery that the letter contained no such promise or pledge as he had alleged it did, still adhered to him. Whether from the natural reluctance of mankind to desert a man whose cause they have once espoused—from their unwillingness to admit that they had themselves been deceived—from feelings of kindness and reverence for the clergyman with whom they had associated at the communion table only two months before; or because they had, in the heat of controversy committed themselves too far to recede, we do not know. Probably some were influenced by one feeling, some by another. But the concealment had been long enough, and the discussions had been angry enough, to have raised an impassible barrier between the bulk of his friends and

his opponents. It had effected its purpose, and the discovery came too late to produce any material change in the relative strength of the parties; and his election, without competition, was now secure.

The election was held on the 6th and 7th of April. Before the voting commenced, a Protest signed by Dr. McLaren, Mr. McLeod and others, having been read, was handed to Mr. Robertson, the chairman of the Trustees and Elders, with the request that it should be entered on the minutes and forwarded to the Presbytery. The Protest was as follows:

"We, the undersigned, Pewholders and Communicants of Saint Andrew's Church in the City of Saint John, Protest against any election of a Minister or Pastor for said Church at this meeting.

"1. Because by the known and long established usages of the Kirk of Scotland, the time for holding a meeting of the Congregation of a Church for the purpose of electing a Minister to fill a vacancy, should be fixed by the Presbytery within whose bounds the Church is situated; or by another Minister, being a member of that Presbytery, appointed for the purpose, who shall give intimation of it from the pulpit of the Church, and who shall afterwards preside over and moderate at such meeting; but the Presbytery of St. John has not fixed the time for this meeting, neither has it appointed any Minister to announce it from the pulpit, neither has it been announced from the pulpit by any member of that Presbytery; and this meeting is neither called, convened or organized for the purpose of electing a Minister for the said Church, in accordance with the usages of the Kirk of Scotland.

"2. Because, neither the Rev. Mr. Baylis who gave the intimation from the pulpit on 26th day of March last; or the Rev. Mr. Burgess, or the Rev. Mr. McKay, who gave notice on the 2nd day of April instant, is a member of the Presbytery of St. John; nor was either of them duly authorised by the said Presbytery, or by the Elders and Trustees to give such notice.

"3. Because it is not competent for the Trustees and Elders to call a meeting for the election of a minister to fill a vacancy in the Church, otherwise than in accordance with the established usages of the Kirk of Scotland. But even if it were competent for them to do so, there is no authority for calling this meeting, but the Resolutions passed at a meeting of the Trustees and Elders, held at the Session House on Saturday.

4th Feb., 1871 ; and the requirements of these Resolutions have not been complied with, inasmuch as circulars have not been sent to the Clerks of Synods in the Dominion of Canada, or notice of the vacancy given in the principal Presbyterian periodicals of the Dominion."

Notwithstanding the protest, the election proceeded. The list of pew owners, submitted by the Trustees, as qualified to vote, contained the names of those only who owned the pews absolutely. It did not contain the names of the holders or leasees of pews from year to year, who constitute a large portion of the congregation. Whether the latter had a legal right to vote or not, depends upon the construction of the Act of Assembly of this Province, 2 Wm. iv. chap. 18, sec. 6, and it may be doubtful. The list or roll of communicants submitted contained about 323 names, whilst the official returns published in the January number of the "Monthly Record" of the Church of Scotland, gave only 200 as the number of communicants connected with St. Andrew's Church. We cannot account for the difference.

Mr. Cameron was elected by the following vote :—Yeas, 126 ; (79 of whom were females) chiefly communicants. Nays, 34 ; (12 of whom were females). Only about one-half of those entitled to vote exercised the privilege.

The return was made at a meeting of the Presbytery held at Fredericton in the month of April, and counsel attended there on our behalf. He took substantially the same exceptions which were raised in the protest. He urged that the Trustees and Elders should have presented their candidate to the Presbytery ; that the Presbytery should have appointed one of their number to give notice of the meeting from the pulpit, who should afterwards have presided and moderated at the meeting, and who should then have certified the result of the election to the Presbytery. None of these requirements, he contended, had been complied with ; and until the result of the election was certified to them by one of their own number, he submitted, they could take no judicial notice of it. Counsel for Mr. Cameron replied that the course of proceeding referred to had become obsolete in Scotland ; and that at all events it could not apply to this Province, where the election was regulated by the Provincial Act of Assembly. The Presby-

tery over-ruled the objections and appointed the 24th day of May to moderate the call. On that day Dr. McLaren filed objections against the induction of Mr. Cameron "on the ground that he used undue influence with some members of St. Andrew's Church, and obtained votes on account of statements made by him and also by some of his supporters which were not consistent with facts;" and on the ground that he had used "deception by suppressing part or parts of a letter for the purpose of conveying a different meaning than the letter conveyed or was meant to convey in its entirety," and also because he believed Mr. Cameron "had made other statements at variance with facts." These objections were filed after a strenuous opposition from Mr. Robertson; and Mr. Cameron was inducted into the pastoral charge of St. Andrew's Church on the 8th day of June instant.

It will be understood that in this statement we have detailed the circumstances in the order of time in which they actually occurred, not in the order in which they came to our knowledge. Some of the facts which we have mentioned were not known at all to us, and others of them not fully understood, until long after they had happened. The contents of the letter of the 2nd November, the omission from the Resolution of the Elders and Trustees on the 4th February, for instance, we were entirely ignorant of until some time in March; the *details* of what took place between Mr. Cameron and Mr. Watson on 4th February, we were not in possession of until he gave them in evidence before the Committee of Presbytery on 9th June. We knew that at the meeting of 4th February, Mr. Watson was one of Mr. Cameron's warmest supporters, and because immediate steps were not then taken to provide for the election of the latter, the former then resigned his office as an Elder, declaring that he would be no party to what he then believed was a gross breach of faith with his friend. We were aware that after the discovery of the draft of the letter of 2nd November, he had frankly avowed that Mr. Cameron had deceived him by suppressing an important part of that letter in reading it to him: but he did not detail all the particulars of the interview with Mr. Cameron as fully as he did afterwards in evidence. Under these circumstances, when it

became necessary to prepare a libel against Mr. Cameron, it was found difficult to state the charges in such a *form* as to correspond *literally* with the evidence to be adduced. In substance, there was no difficulty; substantially, we knew that he had used improper means to procure his nomination and election, and that he had suppressed a portion of the letter in reading it to Mr. Watson, and had thereby deceived him. In the libel which we had prepared, and which we laid before the Presbytery, three charges were made:

1. That Mr. Cameron had falsely and deceitfully represented to various Elders, Trustees and Pewholders of Saint Andrew's Church that he had come out to St. John as assistant to Dr. Donald under a pledge, contained in Dr. Donald's letter of 2nd November, that he should be appointed Dr. Donald's successor in St. Andrew's Church, and that he had made these representations in order to procure his nomination and election to fill the Pastoral charge of the Church.

2. That he had professed to read to various persons the letter of 2nd November, but in doing so had wilfully, deceitfully and wickedly, and in order to deceive those to whom he read it, suppressed those portions of the letter in which Dr. Donald had refused to make any promise or to give him any pledge for a permanent engagement at the end of his year's service as assistant.

3. That he had in other respects wilfully misrepresented the character and contents of that letter.

This libel, and also Dr. McLaren's objections to Mr. Cameron's induction both came before the Presbytery on 9th June, instant. The latter were disposed of first. The Presbytery declined to receive evidence in support of them. Counsel on Dr. McLaren's behalf, thereupon gave notice of appeal, and craved extracts.

After considerable discussion it was decided that a libel could not be filed against a clergyman, until there was a preliminary inquiry or precognition, and the Presbytery resolved itself into a committee of the whole to make such inquiry. Mr. Watson, Mr. Murdoch and Mr. Lindsay were examined before it, and after their evidence was given, counsel for both parties addressed the committee, and it reported back to the Presbytery that the charges contained in the libel were not proved, and that there were no grounds for filing a libel against Mr. Cameron.

During the sitting of the Presbytery Mr. Cameron remained in it, and spoke and voted in it as a member of the Court, whilst it was engaged in discussing Dr. McLaren's objections, and until it resolved itself into a committee. When the evidence was closed and Counsel had addressed the committee, we were all requested by the Chairman, Dr. Brooke, to withdraw, whilst they discussed the matter amongst themselves. We all did so ; but Mr. Cameron remained ; and, we believe, took part in the discussion before the committee, when neither our counsel or ourselves were present.

We have no notes of the evidence taken before the Committee, nor any copies of the correspondence between Mr. Cameron and Dr. Donald, except the Draft of the latter's letter of 2nd Nov ; and the copies given in the previous pages are taken from those published by Mr. Cameron, as already stated. The letter of the 2nd Nov. we know to be correct. Mr. Cameron's letter of 28th Aug. is not, the concluding portion of it having been omitted by him in publishing it. We cannot state whether Dr. Donald's letter of 9th Aug. is a true copy or not, but it is the same as published by Mr. Cameron, and therefore, as against him at least, it must be taken to be true.

We have given the substance of Mr. Watson's and Mr. Murdoch's evidence before the committee in the course of our statement in previous pages. That of Mr. Lindsay was unimportant, and was not referred to by the counsel on either side.

We instructed our Counsel to apply to the Secretary of the Presbytery, Mr. Cameron, in whose custody his letter of 28th August and the evidence taken before the Committee now are, for copies of that letter and of the evidence, with a view to publishing them in full, with this statement ; but he has not furnished them. The correspondence on the subject between our Counsel and Mr. Cameron will be found in Appendices A and B. The letter (A) was written and *delivered* to Mr. Cameron, we are informed, on the morning of the 26th instant ; and if it be dated on 27th, as mentioned in his reply, it is a mistake. Mr. Cameron's reply was received through the office of Mr. Forbes, late in the afternoon of 27th inst. It seems to have taken him a long time to reply to a very plain and explicit letter ; and the answer we think is some-

what disingenuous and evasive. Mr. Duff did not ask for Extracts from the Minutes; he asked for a copy of the evidence taken before the Committee—evidence which was taken down, signed and sworn to by the witnesses at the time—and which requires no comparison to make it correct. And he asked for a copy of Mr. Cameron's letter of 28th August, 1869. Mr. Cameron does not even say whether or not the letter and evidence are in his possession; but his letter would convey the idea, and seems designed to do so, that they are not.

Here then are all the facts, as we can establish them in evidence, if afforded an opportunity of doing so. We have "naught extenuated, or set down aught in malice;" and surely they need no comment. Dr. Donald on 9th August, asked Mr. Cameron if, "for the good of the Church and the glory of its Head," he would be inclined to cast in his lot with us here. Mr. Cameron's reply is given on p. 5, in which the £250 a year, and the successorship to St. Andrew's Church, are painfully prominent. Dr. Donald answered in terms as plain as any man could use, and which we have italicised in the letter, *so far* as regards the salary of \$1000 and the engagement for a year, I will guarantee it to you; but, most emphatically, I will *not make* you any promise of a more permanent engagement. Before the year's engagement has expired, Mr. Cameron begins to manœuvre for the successorship; and he commences his operations by statements which are not borne out by facts, as he rests his claim to it on the ground that Dr. Donald had, in his letter, promised it to him, if his services should be satisfactory to the congregation and himself. When angry discussions and disputes arose as to the terms of the Resolutions passed at the Congregational Meeting, and these Resolutions could not be found, he allowed his friends who had forgotten their terms, to make untrue statements with reference to them, and yet never intimated to them that they were wrong, or that he had in his possession copies of the Resolutions, which would settle all their disputes. When asked by Mr. Murdoch, to let the letter of 2nd November be laid before the Trustees, he replied that it contained private matter, and he could not produce it. We have failed to see anything private in it. When Mr. Watson called on

him for the purpose of getting evidence of the promise made to him by Dr. Donald, so that he might furnish it to the meeting, he read to Mr. Watson one part of a sentence which furnished that evidence, but suppressed the other, which, if read, would have shown that no pledge whatever had been given; but on the contrary, it had been expressly and pointedly refused. Nay, more, he contrived in his conversation with Mr. Watson to cast an imputation of equivocation upon the venerable man whose vacant seat he hoped so soon to fill, and to make that most cruel and unfounded imputation an excuse for not producing the letter itself. Surely to obtain an appointment by means such as these, or to cling to it when so obtained, is derogatory to the character of a Christian minister; beneath the dignity of a man. And it will be a most disastrous day for the Presbyterian Church in New Brunswick, if through any technical objections his conduct shall escape investigation, and he shall be permitted to retain the church which he has so obtained. Surely no church can stand; no church ought to stand which will sanction or even tolerate in any of its ministers practices such as these we have detailed. Let it not be said that the "foes" of the Church of Scotland are "those of its own household."

St. John, 28th June, 1871.

APPENDIX.

A.

Saint John, 26th June, 1871.

DEAR SIR,—I have been instructed by the gentlemen who opposed your induction as Pastor of St. Andrews Church, and who made certain charges against you before the Presbytery, to prepare a Statement of all the Facts, to be printed and laid before the Synod at its next meeting in Saint John. They are desirous that this statement shall be strictly accurate, in reference to all the facts, and they have instructed me to call upon you, as the Secretary of the Presbytery and the person who has the custody of its papers, for a copy of the evidence taken before the Committee on the 9th instant, and also for a copy of your letter to Dr. Donald of the 28th August, 1869, which is also on the files of the Presbytery. I will pay any expense connected with the copying of these papers, on being informed of the amount; or I will employ and pay such person as you may name to make the copies, or the bearer will make them, if permitted.

Please let me have your reply by bearer.

REV. R. J. CAMERON,

King Street.

Yours truly,

(Signed)

CHARLES DUFF.

B.

Saint John, 27th June, 1871.

DEAR SIR,—I received your letter of the 27th inst., requesting me as Clerk of the Presbytery to give you certain extracts from their minutes of last meeting. I did not act as Clerk on that occasion, and the minutes then taken will be formally given to me when they have been read by the Rev. Mr. Keay, who took them, and have been confirmed as correct by the Presbytery.

CHARLES DUFF, Esq.

Believe me, yours truly,

ROBERT J. CAMERON.